



Environment Scrutiny Panel Green Street Police HQ: Traffic and Parking Review hearing with the Minister for Transport and Technical Services

WEDNESDAY, 23rd JANUARY 2013

Panel:

Deputy J.H. Young of St. Brelade (Chairman)
Deputy S.G. Luce of St. Martin
Connétable P.J. Rondel of St. John
Deputy J.M. Maçon of St. Saviour

Witnesses:

Deputy K.C. Lewis of St. Saviour (The Minister for Transport and Technical Services)
Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services
Director of Transport
Manager, Transport Policy

Also present:

Scrutiny Officer

[15:06]

Deputy J.H. Young of St. Brelade (Chairman):

We have introduced ourselves. We have explained the subject of the hearing, which is the scrutiny review of the evidence on the issues of transport and car parking of the proposal to site the new police headquarters on the open area at Green Street car park. I will just explain that Deputy Jeremy Maçon is here. As I am sure you are aware, he is Chairman of the Education and Home Affairs Panel that did the substantive review of the project and what we are doing is linking the 2 panels together to try to ensure we deal with that. Minister, thank you for coming along to

see us. We have looked through in advance of this hearing what paperwork we have and we have accessed the various documents which were submitted as part of the planning application from T.T.S. (Transport and Technical Services) and also documents such as the Sustainable Transport Policy, traffic surveys and the expert reports, which we assume that you are familiar with. Could you introduce yourselves, please? It has been pointed out that I need to do that. Minister, if you could introduce your team.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Thank you very much, Minister. Sorry about that slip on my behalf. Looking through the papers we have got, the starting point I want to refer to is the September 2011 preliminary evaluations of the site carried out by the project team. Those evaluations clearly point out that the Green Street site is a major site of public car parking in the eastern area of town, particularly for commuter parking. Therefore, that report says that for the use of the open area of the Green Street site for other purposes, the loss of car parking is likely to be a very critical factor in such a decision. Could you sum up for us, please, whether that is still the case, in your view, and if it is not why not?

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

As you know, I am not the sponsoring Minister for the Green Street Police Station project, but obviously the land belongs to Property Services and we are facilitating the road reviews, et cetera.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Does that mean you have no view on whether or not car parking is a critical factor?

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

It is critical, yes. We have gone through the Strategic Transport Policy and there is parking available at Pier Road. We have spare capacity at Pier Road.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Is it your view that that is sufficient for you to allow the development to go ahead and lose car parking spaces at Green Street?

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

We are looking at several other options at the moment. There has been car parking provided, apparently, for the police who will be working nearby and that is something that Property Holdings have set up.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Minister, I think the numbers that we have seen in the report, and I apologise if we do not quite get them right, as we understand there are 91 open car parking spaces in that area at the moment.

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

In the open air section?

Deputy J.H. Young:

Yes.

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

Yes, correct.

Deputy J.H. Young:

The new police headquarters will house 220 people working on shifts from 7.00 a.m. to 5.00 p.m. and of that the police themselves estimate that 75 will take up car parking spaces. There are 3 car parking spaces proposed, as we understand it, to be allocated in Snow Hill, so that adds to an impact of the project of 169 car parking spaces as a minimum. Minister, are those figures right? Do you want to comment on that?

Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:

You are assuming everybody who works at the police station drives to work independently, are you not?

Deputy J.H. Young:

No. The police themselves have said the impact is 75 out of the 220 who work on shift. I think there are more police operatives than 220. I think there is some 300 and something, but they are out of hours. I am concentrating on daytime working hours requirements. We are told there are 220 workers on the 7.00 a.m. to 5.00 p.m. shifts and of that 75 people will travel independently using cars. Is that correct?

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

Property Holdings have located parking nearby.

Manager, Transport Policy:

We are comfortable with the scheme whether Property Holdings establish a car parking area privately offsite or not, the point being that the proposal is consistent with the Sustainable Transport Policy, which is that we will be looking to see a reduction in the number of commuter car parking spaces taken up town-wide. So that is why we are able to accommodate the reduction in

91 at Green Street. Your numbers are about right in terms of the number of police cars. The net impact on the public parking stock will be less than that because not all the police are parking on site at Rouge Bouillon at the moment. Some of them are already parking in public parking spaces so they will shift across towards the east of town and some of the displacement will go to Pier Road but the fact that some police officers may choose to park in Patriotic Street, for example, at the moment, has an impact on the overall number of parking spaces and it has an impact on the number of people who choose to park at Pier Road.

Deputy J.H. Young:

So there will be a shift to the east as a result of the project? There will be more spaces created out west?

Manager, Transport Policy:

Yes, that is correct.

Deputy J.H. Young:

But there is an impact east of the tunnel of that sort of order, 169?

Manager, Transport Policy:

Yes. My numbers would be slightly less than that. The total impact on public parking is estimated in the traffic assessment to be about 65.

Connétable P.J. Rondel of St. John:

It is 100 less.

Manager, Transport Policy:

Sorry, the 65 is by the increase in demand from police officers and then there is a 91 reduction in parking spaces. So if you add the 2 together it is of the order of 150.

Deputy J.H. Young:

So it is thereabouts, 150 to 160, by their own estimations. But of course would you accept that when it rains, in adverse conditions it could be a lot worse?

Manager, Transport Policy:

Yes. Not as much as people expect, and we have looked at that, but you get an increase in demand. The reality is that Green Street car park is already full so people have to choose where they are going to park when they commute into town, if they want to come by car.

Deputy J.H. Young:

We have seen some survey documents. I think they are dated November. Is this the most recent car parking survey, these pie charts that we were given?

Manager, Transport Policy:

December was the last car park occupancy survey.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Have you published the December ones?

Manager, Transport Policy:

Have we published them?

Deputy J.H. Young:

Yes. Have the planners got those?

Manager, Transport Policy:

I have not sent those to Planning. I think I have sent them to the Scrutiny Officer.

Deputy J.H. Young:

The ones we have are November.

[15:15]

I am sure you are familiar with this, but if you are not I will pass them down to you. You just said that Green Street car park is full up. What time is it full up?

Manager, Transport Policy:

Between 8.00 a.m. and 9.00 a.m. It has been filling up later than it used to because there has been a migration in office workers more towards the Esplanade. So the Esplanade car park is the most popular one. That is full by 8.00 a.m. whereas Patriotic Street and Green Street fill up a little bit later, but it would certainly be full by 9.00 a.m. most mornings.

Deputy J.H. Young:

What did the survey tell you about the users of that car park, weekday users? Do they work in that area of town?

Manager, Transport Policy:

By and large, yes. We know from our surveys that people are quite lazy and once they have decided to come into town by car they like to get to the car park which is as close as possible to their destination.

Director of Transport:

They like to use their time efficiently.

Deputy S.G. Luce of St. Martin:

I think one of the points we are trying to make is that with a shift pattern that starts at 7.00 a.m. the police officers that decide to drive to work will be driving into an empty car park and the commuters that are normally used to using Green Street will be arriving at their normal time. Notwithstanding there is already 91 places less in the car park, they already have a number of police officers that are parked there. We accept that there is going to be a transference of people around town but the police officers that decide to drive to work will have the option of parking in Green Street at a time when it is relatively empty.

Manager, Transport Policy:

Certainly the shift workers that are starting for a 7.00 a.m. shift will take priority, you are right, and there is quite a lot of people who work for the police station that are civil servants or admin staff and some of the police officers themselves do not work those shifts, so some of them will be coming in later. But obviously the ones that come in earlier will get first access to those parking spaces and the car park will fill up earlier. But interestingly when we interviewed people as to their travel habits and said if the car park is full regularly when you get there, we found that 10 per cent said that they would then walk or cycle or catch the bus. So the reality is that having a little bit of pressure on private car commuters is supportive of the Sustainable Transport Policy, which looks to encourage a modal shift for car commuters. The other aspect of that is that some of them said they would look to get private parking and it came down to only 70 per cent would immediately transfer to other public car parking, of which Pier Road would be the most obvious choice. When you take all those factors, the actual migration to Pier Road would be less than that 150 figure I mentioned just going straight across to Pier Road.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Will there be a clash with overnight parkers if the car park is filling up at 7.00 a.m.? Green Street also provides, if I am correct, the major off-street parking facility for residents of that part of town.

Manager, Transport Policy:

No. There is about 400 free spaces overnight and pretty much the same number Saturdays and Sundays.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Four hundred free spaces in Green Street overnight?

Manager, Transport Policy:

Yes.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Do you know what the split is between the multi-storey and the open area?

Manager, Transport Policy:

No.

Director of Transport:

No, they are just distributed, but what is clear is that in Green Street car park spaces start to become available about 3.00 p.m., so it is pretty occupied between 8.00 a.m. and 9.00 a.m. and round about 3.00 p.m. part-time workers start to leave to go and pick up children and the like. So we do not believe there is an issue for residents using the car park at night and likewise on a Saturday there would not be an impact. There is plenty of capacity.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Going back to the time of arrival issue, some of those you said will give up going by car and go by bus and other means. Are people able to get to work to arrive on shift at 7.00 a.m. reliably by bus?

Manager, Transport Policy:

If they live in the south of the Island they are, yes.

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

The 15 route now comes from west to east through the tunnel, and vice versa, so they have not got the drop-off at the Liberation Station and walking through. They can go direct.

Director of Transport:

The bus service now runs earlier services than it did previously and that approach to providing earlier services to reflect the changes in people's working patterns will be rolled out for the rest of the network over time.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

I know it is very early days but have you got any indicative numbers on the start of the new service, any sort of highlights you can point out to us where immediately CT have made a difference, in positive terms that is? We do not want to hear about negative ones.

Director of Transport:

I do not have data yet, but what I can say is that bus ridership for the month of January has been good. By historic standards it appears from the fare revenue that has been received that ridership has been good.

Deputy J.H. Young:

What about the impact of Lime Grove House being occupied? Have you noticed an impact of that now being occupied by State Street?

Manager, Transport Policy:

We have not. Green Street was always filling up before and it still fills up now. We have not noticed any difference in the occupancy rates that would knock on the effect to Pier Road.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Minister, do you want to say anything on that?

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

I was just checking with the officers regarding car parking. They have got part of it in car park there, State Street? I believe there is private underground parking there.

Manager, Transport Policy:

They have got some private spaces around the back, yes.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Minister, I am just getting towards the end of the numbers issue. Green Street, instead of being allocated for this project, was originally proposed in the previous Island Plan to be used as a potential site for a development of more car parking, was it not? Do you have an idea of how many spaces would have been created there as well and what opportunity has been lost?

Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:

As part of the North of Town Master Plan it was put forward as an alternative mixed development for office accommodation and car parking. What was the actual figure?

Manager, Transport Policy:

Some 10 years ago we looked at an extension, which was 200, it might have been 250 but certainly of the order of 200 or slightly over. It was mentioned as an option for the North of Town Master Plan in the loss of parking at the Town Park but the public felt that it was too far away for it to be a viable alternative.

Deputy J.H. Young:

What can you tell us about the future of the actual multi-storey car park itself, notwithstanding the open area now that is going to be developed or proposed to be developed? What is the condition of it? What is its life?

Director of Transport:

The car park at the moment in the asset register is down as reaching the end of its useful life at 2020. However, by investment in cathodic protection and other concrete protection techniques that life can be extended.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

What is the potential for extending the car park as it stands at the moment? Could you put more floors on it with some sort of meccano-type extra floors? Would that be possible?

Director of Transport:

Yes. In theory some sort of composite deck structure could be put on the top to create an extra half floor parking. You would need some space to put more ramps in.

Deputy J.H. Young:

What is the total number of public car parking spaces in St. Helier now? Can you tell us that?

Manager, Transport Policy:

The total number is just over 3,900, of which about 900 are short stay.

Deputy J.H. Young:

3,900? So we are below the Island Plan threshold of public car parking spaces?**Manager, Transport Policy:**

Yes. What the Island Plan says is that they would not normally approve an application for a public car park if it took the number beyond 4,000. So it is not a minimum that we aspire to, it is a maximum that we aspire to be below.

Deputy J.H. Young:

But it is a threshold?

Manager, Transport Policy:

Yes.

Deputy J.H. Young:

So at the moment we have gone below that threshold. Does that take account of the loss of Green Street spaces?

Manager, Transport Policy:

No. The number at the moment is 3,935, I think, to be exact.

Deputy J.H. Young:

So 3,935? We lose another 91 then.

Manager, Transport Policy:

Yes.

Deputy J.H. Young:

We have already lost spaces for Bath Street.

Manager, Transport Policy:

For the Town Park?

Deputy J.H. Young:

Yes, Town Park.

Director of Transport:

Yes.

Deputy J.H. Young:

We lost spaces at Ann Street.

Manager, Transport Policy:

We created 190 when we lost the parking for the Town Park and we have been able to replace the lost spaces for the work on the Phillips Street site by renting some spaces at the Ann Street brewery site and using the Le Coin development site opposite.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Can you help us with the split between commuter and shoppers?

Manager, Transport Policy:

Yes. There is about 900 shopper spaces, which is Sand Street, Minden Place and Snow Hill, and just over 3,000 commuter spaces.

Deputy J.H. Young:

The surveys that we saw showed that there was demand for increased shopping spaces. Would you agree with that?

Manager, Transport Policy:

Certainly the Sustainable Transport Policy supports an increase in shopper parking spaces within the town and recognises that the greater potential for modal shift is among commuter traffic.

Deputy J.H. Young:

At that point I am going to hand over to my colleagues. I am going to come back but I think I have hogged it for 25 minutes.

The Connétable of St. John:

Can I continue on that? You mentioned Ann Street, Ann Court, et cetera but they are only temporary car parks because they are down for redevelopment.

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

They belong to Housing, yes, but when that is redeveloped there will be underground parking.

The Connétable of St. John:

For the public or for the residents of Ann Court?

Director of Transport:

For public and residents both.

The Connétable of St. John:

Exactly, so what is the split?

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

For which site, for Ann Court?

Manager, Transport Policy:

The North Town Master Plan proposes 185 public spaces and then residential would probably be of the order of 120, so they would be looking to put in 2 floors.

The Connétable of St. John:

That being the case on the Ann Court one, what was the number that we could put in there without having to go down the road of total redesigning the roads? I know this came up in the past that if we had a car park on that site of X number of vehicles we had to have new street works done and that was unacceptable at the time. What is the number that is required for that to happen?

Manager, Transport Policy:

Are you saying at what point would you need an improved road infrastructure?

The Connétable of St. John:

Yes.

Manager, Transport Policy:

We showed that a multi-storey car park of 600 spaces was workable when we were looking at closing Charles Street to pedestrianise the route through into the town centre. I think we showed that something like 550 was workable and when you went higher than that it became unworkable, but the States then found that a large above ground multi-story car park there was not appropriate so the North Town Master Plan changed to a much smaller number.

Deputy J.M. Maçon of St. Saviour:

Can I just ask how much is currently in the car park trading fund?

Director of Transport:

Good question. I have not brought that figure with me and I would not like to hazard a guess. I would prefer to get an informed figure and let you know.

The Connétable of St. John:

You cannot even give us a ballpark figure?

Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:

It is irrelevant to this hearing, I am afraid.

Director of Transport:

The car park trading fund is set up to replace the assets as they reach the end of their useful life and also to maintain the assets during their working life. So the car park trading fund is complex. If you are talking about a ballpark figure, I would have to go back to the office and have a look at the fund itself.

Deputy J.M. Maçon:

Let me explain why I am raising this. We are talking about the impact of traffic in this area and, while it has been argued by the department that there is extra capacity at Pier Road, your own department's survey, Minister, points out that 94 per cent of those who use Green Street would find it not at all convenient or not very convenient to move from Green Street to Pier Road. Therefore, I am not entirely sure who suggested it but I think a possible redevelopment of ...

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

Are we talking about Ann Court?

Deputy J.M. Maçon:

No, the one just next to the roundabout. Snow Hill, that is the one. Snow Hill has been alleged. Basically what I want to know is what are the costs of having to redo that, which you should know because you have done the figures, and how much is available in the car park trading fund in order to achieve that?

Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:

We have been given very limited time to prepare for this and we are looking at the parking and the effects of the police station development. If you want a review of parking strategy and the issues longer term on that I think that is another scrutiny topic that we can look into if we get the relevant time to prepare for it. What I would say is we have done some work on Snow Hill and the potential of a second deck on Snow Hill, which is probably the only viable solution that has come up, which we have got costs associated with it, which would provide an additional 90 spaces on Snow Hill. What is difficult with that is Snow Hill is quite an historic ... the cutting is a very historic area and it is quite sensitive in terms of the accessibility of that and it is not something we can say is a guarantee or something that we would like to explore too much at this stage but it is something we have been looking at. We had a workshop about 3 months ago to look at that as a potential solution for that area but it was particularly focused on shoppers provision because it is probably the best place to gain access to town for shoppers.

[15:30]

Director of Transport:

That was what I was going to add. During the States debate of the Sustainable Transport Policy there was an amendment brought forward by Constable Crowcroft that we should undertake a study of Snow Hill and provide a report back to the States, so that took place last year. That report will be presented to the States shortly and the findings are, as the Chief Officer said, 90 spaces. With regards to the car park trading fund, the way the trading fund works is it builds up a sum of money and then it goes down to zero, so it depends at what point of time you look at it. At the moment the car park trading fund is building up a sum of money to create underground car parking at Ann Court, for instance, and also for other things that are projected into it. So there is a sum in there at the moment but the point at when you want to invest it is what you have to look at.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Is what you are saying then that this proposal that I think has surfaced in some of these documents about the opportunities that exist at Snow Hill should not be regarded as a mitigating factor for loss of commuting car parking spaces at Green Street? It should be seen as a measure to reduce the unfulfilled demand and shortfall in shopping car parking spaces. Is that what you are saying?

Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:

There is a bit of an issue here in that we are trying to look at car parks in isolation and the reality is that through a States decision Gas Place was shut and we lost 400 spaces and the private site next to it lost 230. We replaced that with how many spaces initially?

Manager, Transport Policy:

190 at Ann Place.

Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:

We had a massive shift and what happened is people modulated their behaviour. We hope some of them started commuting using motor cycles or bicycles or walked to work or used the bus, but a lot of people went elsewhere. The reality with Jersey, and it is a bit of a shock to people, is you can walk across St. Helier in 10 minutes. I used to commute to Leeds city centre and walk 12 minutes across Leeds city centre from where I parked to where my office was. That is what people do in cities and towns and that is what people do here if that convenient place is not available. So I think you have got to look at the car parking provision in the round and not focus on just one car park. Ideally we would surround the city centre with so many car parks that you cannot see anything else but the reality is that is not what we are going to do. We have got a vision now. We have got a Sustainable Transport Policy, we have got a better bus service, we are

promoting other forms of transport, and we are getting people to be innovative in how they travel into their workplace. It is all part of the round. Your original question, Deputy, about is this a detrimental effect to our car parking on that car park, the answer is yes, but can we cope with that, the answer is yes, and the other priorities for the States of Jersey are viewed as higher.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Can I suggest the answer I am hearing is you believe you can cope with it? I think I heard you say that the early evidence from the new bus service is you are getting some confidence and you are seeing some transfer there. I am a little bit puzzled as to where that argument runs in terms of shoppers because we have got clear evidence in the surveys that the majority of people are saying that they would value more shopping car parking spaces. It must be different by its nature because commuting car parking strikes me as being they are there all day. Where people shop they are going to be influenced by the travel time to carry shopping, are they not? That is what they are going to be ...

Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:

There are 2 fundamentally different elements here, commuting and shopping, and I think again the confusion of that is a difficulty. For shopping car parking, if you look at the centre of the world being the market you have to have a very short distance to and from the market from where your shoppers are and where your key people need to come, get heavy bags. Minden Place, for example, is quite an old car park, quite restricted in terms of its size and space, but in terms of the market it is very convenient and popular. You have to think of shoppers as a very different issue and it does not really have a bearing on Green Street.

Deputy J.H. Young:

There is probably where maybe I confused it. I was trying to lead into inviting you to say that Snow Hill is not a factor that should be brought in in terms of the commuting car parking strategy.

Director of Transport:

I would agree with that. Also in regards to shopper car parking, just to add a bit of detail to what you were discussing, the typical occupancy rates, other than at times like Christmas, are about 50 per cent but one of the issues always with shopper car parking is how it is distributed geographically and how it supports the economy of town, and that is an important consideration in deciding whether Snow Hill should be expanded at some point or not.

The Connétable of St. John:

Can I ask a question before we move on too far from this? You mentioned ring-fencing the car park trading fund, yet some weeks ago, or months ago now, the Minister for Treasury suggested dipping into that fund for other things. Did that happen or is it still ring-fenced that he cannot get his fingers into that money?

Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:

The eastern cycle route was funded by the car park trading fund, based on a States decision.

The Connétable of St. John:

There we are. So it does get dipped into.

Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:

It gets dipped into and it is disastrous because it ...

The Connétable of St. John:

So therefore it is no longer ring-fenced?

Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:

It is ring-fenced but ...

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

If it is a States decision it is a States decision.

The Connétable of St. John:

Yes, I appreciate that but I have seen that happen with Social Security where we were told on a one-off we would take £6 million and now we are going in annually raiding that fund, and it looks as if this might happen here. So that needs to be recorded.

Director of Transport:

What I would like to add if possible and explain is the car park trading fund does not only fund the pay car parks in town. It also funds the 81 car parks spread across the Island which often are free, often run a service and provide an important amenity to tourists and locals alike to enjoy the beach in the summer or to visit the countryside.

The Connétable of St. John:

Yes, I accept that. I was aware of that because of my history with the department.

Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:

We try to protect the car park trading fund but it can be a very popular lump of money to pick out and to utilise in other schemes.

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

But in the long term it can be disastrous.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Can I just go back to the issue of alternative parking provision for commuters who cannot get into Green Street? I think you said that Pier Road was the most likely one. Are there others?

Manager, Transport Policy:

Funnily enough, it is interesting to note that La Route du Fort Cleveland Road car park very rarely fills up, well in fact never fills up as far as my statistics suggest.

Director of Transport:

In the daytime.

Manager, Transport Policy:

Yes. It has got 81 spaces and in the middle of the day in the last survey we did last December it had 44 spare spaces, so people are going past a car park that is only half full to park.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Is there a maximum length of park there?

Manager, Transport Policy:

No.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Is that a normal season ticket car park or a pay one?

Manager, Transport Policy:

Yes, it is a completely normal commuter car park.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Is it States or parish?

Manager, Transport Policy:

States. So there is a little bit of spare capacity there. Pier Road is the most obvious one because Pier Road is the one that always has spare space and then you get a ripple effect. You might

think Patriotic Street is irrelevant to this argument but I would argue that it is relevant because it is the overall commuter parking stock that counts and Patriotic Street sometimes has spare space. Pier Road typically has about 250 but then there is another 100 or so dotted around a few of the other car parks.

Deputy J.H. Young:

How long has the surplus space, as you have told us, at Pier Road been going on? Have you been able to account for that? Is it changes in patterns of employment in town?

Manager, Transport Policy:

It has a similar spare capacity in recent years but if you go back many years there was a time when Pier Road filled up completely. It was not unusual to see a queue of people coming out into Pier Road. That is going back 15, 20 years.

Deputy J.H. Young:

What changed?

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

Originally there were barriers on Pier Road.

Manager, Transport Policy:

So in fact there is better availability of parking now than there was many years back.

Deputy J.H. Young:

One of the reasons why I ask is because in the Island Plan it talks about in the future the opportunity for replacing Pier Road car park with residential development, which is obviously a very suitable location. Do you have any thoughts on the knock-on effects of moving commuting car parking into Pier Road to reverse that situation?

Manager, Transport Policy:

Pier Road is the least popular car park. If the Sustainable Transport Policy is successful we estimate that there would be a drop in demand for commuter parking of about 1,000 spaces in the public car parks. The Sustainable Transport Policy would reduce the number of cars parked in town by about 2,000.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Over what period?

Manager, Transport Policy:

The target in the S.T.P. (Sustainable Transport Policy) is 2015. Whether we achieve that, because we are not that far away from that, remains to be seen.

Deputy J.H. Young:

At that point would Pier Road become available for residential development? Presumably it is needed to service Fort Regent?

Manager, Transport Policy:

Yes. I think you have got local needs, particularly Fort Regent, but in theory if the S.T.P. was successful you could see a day where Pier Road would be virtually empty, as it is on a Saturday.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

I wanted to come on to the Sustainable Transport Plan, which I have got down here as 2010 to 2014. I do not know whether that means the end of 2014.

Manager, Transport Policy:

2015 is the target.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

Is that the beginning of 2015 or the end?

Director of Transport:

It is not clear. It says by 2015.

Manager, Transport Policy:

2015 is the target.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

I do not think it is all that relevant but I would say, Minister, there is a target of a 15 per cent reduction in peak traffic as well as other things and I just wondered if you could give us a resumé of where we are with the transport plan and whether we look like we are going to hit our targets by the time the plan is due to be completed.

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

It is early days with buses. I would eventually like to expand the school bus service. A case in point regarding the 15 per cent is we lose 15 per cent of the traffic when the schools are on

holiday. We take approximately 1,000 school pupils to school in the morning and take home 1,400, which seems to imply that there is 400 trips in the daytime that are completely unnecessary, clogging up the roads from Mont Millais down Wellington Hill. The more youngsters we can get on the buses the better. Obviously it is parents going into work and doing the loop around on their way.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

Minister, it says in the plan that a £5 a day parking charge increase would double the use of buses.

Director of Transport:

Fifty pence.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

It says £5 a day here. Would that equate to ... how many hours in your day as regards your car parking charges, 8, 10?

Manager, Transport Policy:

Either 8 or 9 for a typical commuter.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

It says here the £5 a day parking charge increase would double bus use. Would you consider doing that in the next 12, 18 months if it does not look like we are reducing the number of cars?

Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:

There are lots of levers that can be used. This is one of the issues of lowering car parking charges at some of our less popular car parking destinations, car parks. What it does is it gets people off the bus. There is this fine line between the incentivisation of utilising public transport behaviour change versus the carrot and stick. If we were a private operator of car parks the car park charging would go up substantially. However, we have a political control and the Minister has a careful balance to make between punishing the commuter and also getting behaviour change. So it is a fine line.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

Yes, but the Minister still has a political commitment to the Sustainable Transport Policy which says he is going to reduce traffic by the end of 2014.

Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:

If he is supported by his fellow colleagues then he might get a chance at doing that, but it is a very difficult situation and I think representations when they put car parking charges up last time were quite substantial from some members of your panel, as I recall.

Director of Transport:

Can I clarify one item? Someone may have misheard, as I did. The proposal is to increase parking charges so the cost for an 8-hour day is £5.28. It is not a £5 per day increase. It is to increase parking from what it is now to £5.28.

Deputy J.H. Young:

That is as we speak. Has that been implemented?

Manager, Transport Policy:

No. We have done basically inflationary rises.

Director of Transport:

This is above inflation.

Manager, Transport Policy:

If you look at the detail of the Sustainable Transport Policy it spoke about all the various measures that we thought would be necessary to achieve our 15 per cent target and one of them was increasing car parking charges above inflation. When the policy went to the States there was an amendment proposed by the Constable of St. Mary, which was approved, which said that the cost of motoring, including parking, should not be increased disproportionately until a viable alternative was in place for all. How you interpret that viable alternative, obviously we will want to say that when the bus service is as good as it is going to get then we would argue that viable alternative is in place. For the time being the political decision was that we would work on the carrot measures in the Sustainable Transport Policy but the stick measures of increasing the cost of parking a car in our car parks would only go up by inflation. It would not be hiked up beyond that as a mechanism to force people to leave their cars at home.

[15:45]

Deputy J.H. Young:

Is that policy implemented? Have you got the resources? Are we talking about a live document that realistically is going to have the effects that you have told us you are relying upon?

Manager, Transport Policy:

As I say, it is a document that the department is working really hard to implement. All the measures in there are being implemented, we are working on them, with the one exception of increasing the cost of parking above inflation. We are working on travel plans, we are working with all the schools to see how they can use their cars less, we are improving the bus service, we are striving to put in cycle routes, improve pedestrian facilities.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Minister, have you got the funds for that?

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

Yes. We are in the early stages of the A.N.P.R. (automatic number plate recognition) and if that is successful, which I think it will be, then that can rolled out at other multi-storey car parks. We will have plumbed-in computers so we will be able to monitor what is happening everywhere.

Deputy J.H. Young:

I am sorry to interrupt, Steve. Do you want to follow through or shall I?

The Deputy of St. Martin:

No, you carry on.

The Connétable of St. John:

I have got a question before we go much further. I am listening to what you are saying. All your surveys that you are talking about have been done in the last 3 to 4 years in a time of recession, when needless to say the pound in the pocket is not going as far, people are finding alternative ways of getting in. As soon as this recession is finished, and hopefully it is before 2015 but it could go up to 2018, and people have money in their pocket again, we will be back to full car parks. Historically we have had these ups and downs in smaller recessions when people find things tough and therefore they find alternative means. As soon as they are in full employment and everything else and everything is rosy the numbers will be up again. I have looked at all your reviews on buses and everything else and I still have not seen all these big figures move on to the buses in real numbers because you are not giving a service to the people who actually need it.

Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:

We have spent 2 years of hell going through a new bus contract. We are in the first month. I think it is unfair to suggest that we are not doing what we are doing.

The Connétable of St. John:

I am not saying that you are not doing what you are doing.

Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:

There is a big journey here and the biggest influence will be the bus contract and the way the new bus operator works to the new contract we have got in place which incentivises them to get more people and more ridership. The trials and tribulations we have had over contracts, et cetera, has been one of making sure that the citizens of Jersey get the bus service they deserve and it particularly focuses on the commuter, which fundamentally hits square on to the car commuter. But there are lots of things we have not done yet. There is car-sharing, which happens in many other jurisdictions. There is cycling, which we have promoted and we can promote even more. We do not get through traffic here. There is no motorways to go across. I have cycled in Leeds, I have cycled in many cities where you have to go through an underpass under a motorway and it is frightening. There are a huge per cent of people who live in St. Helier who drive into a car park and park up.

Director of Transport:

In the survey for Green Street, 23 per cent of people who use Green Street car park live in the parish of St. Helier. Obviously not all of them live in the environs of town but that is quite ...

Deputy J.H. Young:

Is that daytime parking, commuter parking?

Director of Transport:

Yes, commuting parking, so people arriving in the morning. That is people leaving their car there in the morning.

Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:

What we have to do is make the adequate provision of urban corridors for people who can feel safe walking to their place of work and feel safe walking their kids to school and bring it back to where it was in the good old days when cars did not dominate this Island.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Can I just check one thing? Do we charge the same price for commuting car parking compared with shopping car parking?

Director of Transport:

Yes, per hour we do. There is now an option to stay in Sand Street car park longer than the normal shopper time in which time you incur an escalating charge. Where we do not charge the same amount for parking is outside town where much of it is one unit for 2 hours.

Deputy J.H. Young:

But it would be open to you to look at ways of ensuring the shopper has provisions but at the same time achieving this shift of commuting parking.

The Connétable of St. John:

In doing that, could you not put a ring around the lower area of St. Helier for commuters and charge a different rate of people who live within but below the hills? When you start going up the hills it can be a nightmare for somebody of a certain age and whatever else. Ring-fence that and say if your vehicle is registered in this part of town and a certain distance that you ... as soon as you start up the hills then you have got a different rate.

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

We have looked at that. It is postcode parking. I think that was brought up about 2 years ago.

Manager, Transport Policy:

We were thinking more from the point of view of incentivising people who live in the west to park, say, at Patriotic Street and if you live in the east to park in Green Street and so on so you get less cross-town trips. I take your point that if you really wanted to be clever you could say if you are driving from Rouge Bouillon to Green Street then you are going to have to pay a lot more than somebody who has driven from the top of ...

Director of Transport:

It does involve rolling out the technology that you have seen in Sand Street type of car parks. Whether you do it or not is one thing but it would be within the scope of the technology to start looking at things like that.

Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:

One of the things we have noticed from the Sand Street trial is some people are parking all day there at the cost of ... how much is it a day?

Director of Transport:

£21 if you are there a whole day. Just under half the people, about 40 per cent I believe, are paying with their debit or credit card and incurring an additional charge for doing that and are obviously happy to do so, given that there is an alternative.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

Can I get back to my transport policy then? On the basis that I am not going to get an answer to whether we are going to hit the 15 per cent target, can I phrase the question a different way, Minister?

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

Yes, we are.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

I fully appreciate we are in the early days of our new bus contract but, Minister, if we get to the end of this year and we have not started to get people on to buses in the numbers that we expect, I think where I am coming from is would you set a deadline where you will start to increase parking charges in town to get people on to buses, or are you just going to rely on the fact that the timetable will improve? There must be a point in time at which you will say charges must now go up in order to get people on to buses.

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

I will always use the carrot before the stick with people and I am confident that the bus service will improve in leaps and bounds. It is my vision that unless somebody particularly wants to use a car they will not have to in the very near future, that the whole Island will be saturated. With a double decker bus now you can go from the airport to Le Marais and vice versa and that cross-town, cross-tunnel service seems to be very valuable and going down very well with the general public.

Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:

When we were developing the Sustainable Transport Policy, which is 3 years ago now ...

Manager, Transport Policy:

Approved at the end of 2010.

Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:

... one of the really interesting figures we got from Sustrans, which is a sustainable transport body which advised on that, was they could have obtained all the modal shift we wanted by engaging with the citizens of Jersey and doing it without spending anything on infrastructure. That is not even changing the bus service and not building more cycle tracks or anything and we believe we

could have made our 15 per cent with just engagement. There is a lot of untapped things there that we can do, which are softer things, but it is about getting people more physically fit, making people understand that cycling to work and all the other methods of being cleverer in terms of how we commute is something that they can do as part of their lives.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

Before I leave the transport policy, there is something else I would just like to mention here. It says that a 12-minute saving in bus time travel for half of users would increase the bus use by 47 per cent. Is there any scope anywhere on this Island that we could introduce proper bus lanes, Minister, so that we could get buses driving past cars that are queued up coming into town?

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

We have looked at that. Our officers have been looking at that very carefully. There were several areas we looked at on the west of the Island but it proved that it was not really feasible and would be horrendously expensive. Sadly we are driving on roads that were built originally by General Don so we do not have the scope for any bypasses or knocking people's houses down to put an extra lane in. There may be an opportunity, is it West Park?

Director of Transport:

The approach to the roundabout at West Park is obviously one opportunity where you have a wider carriageway. The other thing that we are now beginning to look at seriously is more innovative ways of reducing those times for buses by looking at whether we can put transponders and the like in buses at certain junctions, giving them priority at traffic signals. Trying to achieve the same thing without increasing the road width and shortening journey times.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

Have you thought about closing roads so that only buses can drive up and down them?

Manager, Transport Policy:

That is probably how you would have to ... we looked at a scheme at Beaumont which involved land take when Mike Jackson was our Minister and he felt it was too radical to include in the plan. If you are going to make serious improvements for buses you would end up needing to be more radical and reallocating road space to buses. We have got one or 2 areas where we could do that and it would be less radical.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

Had anybody considered bus lanes before we re-tarmacked Victoria Avenue?

Manager, Transport Policy:

There have been several studies done on having a bus lane along Victoria Avenue as well as a high occupancy vehicle lane. You would not be allowed to use the lane unless you had 2 or 3 people in your car. The implications of that was that a lot of people would shift on to the inner road. The modelling did not really look very positive so the scheme has never seen the light of day. It is quite radical and whether the public are ready for something as radical as that ...

Deputy J.H. Young:

I would like to focus on this because it is a very interesting subject. I would like to focus in on it as how it affects particularly the Green Street area, if I can. Questions of trying to get increased ridership, reducing car parking are all relevant as to forming an opinion on the likelihood of the target you are setting being achieved. Just focusing on that area, looking at the layouts we have seen, it is obviously a very busy road. If I have got it right, I understand the peak traffic flow is around 1,100 vehicles in both directions.

Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:

Sorry, which road?

Deputy J.H. Young:

The exit to the tunnel, Route du Fort. Would I be right in saying that?

Manager, Transport Policy:

The flow through the tunnel is about 2,000 in total, slightly less on Route du Fort. That 1,100 would be a one-way direction peak flow per hour.

Deputy J.H. Young:

At the moment there is a bus pull-in bay on the Limes side, is there not?

Manager, Transport Policy:

Yes.

Deputy J.H. Young:

The proposal, I understand, is to close and dedicate it to other uses, which we will cover in a minute, but basically the buses will be stopping in the road. In the other direction going east, would the buses be stopping in the road too?

Manager, Transport Policy:

Yes. There is not a bus layby there.

Deputy J.H. Young:

What bus routes go there and what is the frequency of buses?

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

That would be the extension of the 15.

Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:

I think the bigger question is if you are a fit and able person working for the police then the bus station is probably a 5-minute walk away, which gives you access to all the buses.

Deputy J.H. Young:

The question in my mind is are we going to have congestion in this road caused by a loss of bus bay to allow buses to pull in and are we going to have a continual flow of ... looking at the papers, routes 1, 2, 3, 18, 15 all seem to go down that route and there seems to be for all services anything between 15 and 20 minutes. That suggests to me that the buses stopping and blocking the road will be quite frequent. Within an hour, with even one minute waiting to fill up a bus with passengers, you might have 20 minutes lost. Have you looked at that problem? Is it is a problem?

Manager, Transport Policy:

They have all got different routes. Route 3, for example, goes up through Grenville Street, route 1 goes down Green Street to Havre des Pas so you would have to get off in Green Street. You would not get off immediately outside the police station, Route du Fort. Route 15 has been merged with the 18 and I think I am right in saying it is going straight along Route du Fort and not along Grenville Street. They have all got different routes. It is not as simple as to add up all those routes you have just mentioned and say they will all be stopping outside the police station.

The Connétable of St. John:

But a percentage will?

Manager, Transport Policy:

Some would, yes.

The Connétable of St. John:

Have you taken that into account?

Manager, Transport Policy:

We have not done a modelling exercise on the implications of stopping buses on that road, no.

Deputy J.H. Young:

How long does a bus take? With the new operators presumably they are settling down now. How long does it take them to load up with people and get away?

Manager, Transport Policy:

You mentioned the Limes going there. That has never been used as a collection point so it is much quicker to drop people off. People do not get off there at all at the moment but we would encourage the bus service to stop there if people want to get off for State Street and the police station. It would increase in its use as a drop-off point. Drop-off points are much quicker than loading points. Loading points will work quicker because the bus company will be operating smart cards in the near future and then people will do a card and get on so your boarding times will get much quicker.

[16:00]

Director of Transport:

I would just like to point out that one of the advantages of merging the number 15 and number 18 is people from the west of the Island who work in that area can now get directly to that area and also on the trip home they do not have to walk down to Liberation Station. They can get on the bus there or at Snow Hill for the trip home.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

Minister, while we are talking about roads and the bus stops outside the proposed police station site, the road is considerably wide in that area. What considerations have you given to some creative road works to allow for buses and other things?

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

The team are looking at that now actually.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

So the plans that we have in front of us for just a continuation of what we have at the moment could well change?

Manager, Transport Policy:

There is a crossing facility proposed that will be much easier for pedestrians to get across Route du Fort right opposite the police station and there is a right-turning lane for vehicles that are turning into the police station.

Director of Transport:

The crossing on Green Street will be improved. We propose to improve that as well outside the car park entrance.

Manager, Transport Policy:

We have not got proposals at the moment.

Director of Transport:

Where the traffic island is, we were looking at that.

Deputy J.H. Young:

So there is a new plan to come? You are on the case, as it were.

Director of Transport:

In terms of pedestrian improvements, yes.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

Did you not consider there was a possibility of a scope for having proper pull-in bus stops on both sides of the road by shaping the way the road went through that area?

Manager, Transport Policy:

If you do the motor cycle and bike parking that we think is essential as part of the package on the south side of Route du Fort you would not then have room for a bus layby and 2 lanes of traffic.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

If you decided that the motor cycle and bike parking was not essential on the other side of the road?

Manager, Transport Policy:

Our recommendation is that it is because we want to encourage sustainable transport and part of the package is that the police station will increase its proportion of motor cycle and bicycle parking facilities.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

Have you considered the consequences of putting that parking inside Green Street car park?

Manager, Transport Policy:

Well, you would lose more parking spaces.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

Yes, but you would not lose a lot of parking spaces for that number of motor bikes, would you?

Manager, Transport Policy:

You do lose quite a lot. You will lose a car parking space for about every 3, possibly 4 motorbikes and get slightly more bike parking spaces. The bike parking is being accommodated satisfactorily as far as we are concerned both on Route du Fort and also the entry to the cemetery at the other end of Green Street where there will be another dozen or so.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Is there no room for pushing the building back to offset a further parking bay, so that buses coming from the west can offload without blocking the road, visitors to the police headquarters can get off safely?

Director of Transport:

In terms of pushing the whole master building back in its current geometry, no, there would not be because you would lose car parking spaces. You would have to eat up some of the existing multi-storey structure and move the lift shaft further into the multi-storey structure, so in that respect, whether there is scope to alter the geometry of the building I would not know.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Would that be a desirable thing that if you could get a bus bay for vehicles travelling east, for buses coming east outside? Would that be an advantage?

Manager, Transport Policy:

It is not something I would have considered particularly critical.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Would it be an advantage?

The Deputy of St. Martin:

If parking was particularly difficult in that area and we are providing a really good bus service which is accessible into St. Helier from all parts of the Island, frequently, at a reasonable cost, would you accept that people wanting to visit or work at the police station would appreciate a safe

bus stop right outside, that doing that would alleviate a lot of these issues we have got with parking cars?

Manager, Transport Policy:

No, I would not. All a bus layby does is get the bus out of the way of traffic. A bus layby advantage is for car traffic that is using the same road as the bus. It does not help the bus users. The bus stop which is coming on the south side where there is a bus layby at the moment will be converted into a stop that stops in the traffic flow with a boarding footpath that will be raised up so it will be more wheelchair friendly.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

So there is no statistics to say that a bus stop which is off road, for want of a better word, is better used and appreciated by the people using the buses?

Manager, Transport Policy:

People who use the buses appreciate things like bus shelters and raised footpaths so they can load the bus at the same level. They do not need a bus layby to do that.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

I appreciate that. I am just trying to work out whether there is ...

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

It could be said that it would be preferable to road users but not bus users because they are on the bus anyway or off the bus.

Deputy J.H. Young:

What about waiting? If you are standing there waiting for a bus is it not nicer to stand and wait in a layby and not have vehicle pouring water all over you from the road, from rain? When you see lorries and buses showering pedestrians waiting on narrow pavements for buses, is it not more friendly? It is one of the busiest roads in the Island. I do not know how wide the pavement is there, I have not measured it.

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

I think it is wide enough. It would be more friendly, yes. I cannot argue with that.

The Connétable of St. John:

You have obviously seen the report from the Roads Committee of St. Helier who are opposed to the general situation. That being the case, you have obviously discussed it with them and they have the roads committee, they do their bit for their parish. How often do you get round the table with them?

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

Quite regular meetings. Our officers have regular meetings, some of which I attend.

Manager, Transport Policy:

We have a dialogue with them. We attended a public meeting that the parish roads committee set up and we have private meetings with them.

The Connétable of St. John:

They have raised concerns about insufficient parking for things like the honorary police, the advocates, the probation service, translators, et cetera, who have to attend at all times of the day or night, in particular the day. Where will there be parking? There are a whole host of reasons why they should be parking on site.

Manager, Transport Policy:

The operational issues are more for the police to comment on than us, but certainly things like honorary police, people that have got a function that involves the police station will be given passes and they will go down and be able to use the basement car park. I understand that the police response is that they are comfortable that all those sort of issues are being met.

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

Do you not have a time about midday or 11.00 a.m. when spaces start to free up in Green Street?

Manager, Transport Policy:

From the afternoon you can get into Green Street car park, yes. You might have to wait a minute or 2 but for general visitor parking Green Street becomes less of a problem in the afternoon. It is more in the morning you do not get the turnover so if you choose to wait in the entrance to Green Street car park you could have to wait quite a while. In the afternoon that problem falls away so a visitor would be able to park in Green Street.

The Connétable of St. John:

Yes, but that is only for that period. If they are at 9.00 a.m. or whatever time just before going to court, because this is when these people will be generally doing their business between 8.00 a.m. and 9.00 a.m. before a 10.00 a.m. court sitting ...

Manager, Transport Policy:

Parking for general visitors I would concede is not ideal but it would be the same as if you have got visitors to States buildings, to Cyril Le Marquand House, to other Government buildings, Social Security in La Motte Street. All these places are in a town centre and they do not have parking outside the front door so you use public parking in the area and walk to the door. That is the logic with the police station.

The Connétable of St. John:

Minister, would you consider this is the right site for a police headquarters? They have looked at others and the Minister for Home Affairs himself I believe said recently in an interview that there are better sites.

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

That is a matter for the Minister for Home Affairs and the Minister for Treasury who have chosen this site.

The Connétable of St. John:

No, leave the Minister for Treasury out of it. We know what his views are because he is trying to get himself out of a hole. I am talking about the Minister for Home Affairs.

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

The Minister for Home Affairs? Well, if he is happy that that is the site for him, which I presume he is, then obviously we have to accommodate that. The site does not belong to us.

The Connétable of St. John:

You say you have to accommodate it. Surely you are going to give a report which is factual of the actual needs of the parish of St. Helier or the Island of Jersey not of what is accommodating the Minister or the Council of Ministers to put a quart into a pint pot.

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

I thought you were asking if I was happy with it.

The Connétable of St. John:

Yes, correct, and you sit on the Council of Ministers, so are you happy that a quart will go into a pint pot?

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

I am not an architect. If they say it will fit snugly in there then it will fit. Obviously my remit would just be parking and roads, et cetera, and we can accommodate it there. If you are asking would I have picked that particular spot, I would not have thought of putting it there from day one, I must admit.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Would you, Minister, still say what you said on 23rd April? Do you remember talking to us on 23rd April?

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

You will have to refresh me on that one, I am afraid. I probably said a lot on 23rd April.

Deputy J.H. Young:

On 23rd April when we saw you in a public setting you said: "I am in favour of the new police station being built. I would rather it was built elsewhere."

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

I do not recall saying that but if I said that, yes. As I said, I would not have thought of putting it there. If I was driving past I would not have said: "That is where I want a police station", but if that is where they want it then that is where they want it.

Deputy J.H. Young:

One of the things, Minister, in looking at the formal submission that went forward to Planning, it has got on it at the bottom "Manager, Transport Policy". I do not know if you have seen this document dated 14th January. I assume it has been produced by your officers but it is not signed. It makes the point, what you have told us there, that it is consistent with the States Sustainable Transport Policy, you have explained that, but it also says: "Releases land for housing."

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

That would be the old police station, Rouge Bouillon area.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Could you explain why it is relevant to a decision on whether or not Green Street is suitable on traffic grounds releasing land for housing at Summerland? Why is it relevant?

Manager, Transport Policy:

I made that comment because it is part of the package that is proposed. At the same time if the police station does move to that site then it releases land for housing which, from a transport policy point of view, is ideal.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Would it not do the same on any other site?

Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:

It depends on the site.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Why is it relevant to Green Street?

Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:

It is relevant to transport in that if you live in town you do not have to commute into town, so local housing.

Deputy J.H. Young:

If it is another town-based site, why is it relevant to Green Street?

Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:

If it is another town-based site then there will be different comments associated with it, but for that comment the comment is absolutely right. The Sustainable Transport Policy does not work against what has been proposed and having more accommodation and more people living in town supports the Sustainable Transport Policy in that people need a car less and they are not commuting into town for doing their work.

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

Can I just touch on bus ridership again? When I was newly elected to the States I did campaign for later opening hours at the transport centre, Liberation Station, and it was moved from 6.00 p.m. to 8.00 p.m. but Liberty Bus I believe now open until 10.00 p.m. except on, I think, Sunday nights. We are putting up as many bus shelters as we can so that people are not waiting in the rain and we have 2 coming up now, Grande Route de St. Jean and one in Trinity. That has put a smile on the Constable's face.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Can I ask you, Minister, have you seen this formal submission? It is 14th January. It is the T.T.S. submission on which the Minister will base his decision. You have seen that?

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

Yes.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Do you agree with it?

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

Yes. That is your report, is it not?

Manager, Transport Policy:

Yes.

Deputy J.H. Young:

There a couple of areas I would like to touch upon. It says that conditions of planning consent should require an effective travel plan and it talks about motorcycle parking and bicycle parking. Steve, do you want to pick up the travel planning?

The Deputy of St. Martin:

I was just about to mention that, Chairman. There are a number of issues here. The first question, I guess, Minister, is have you received one?

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

The travel plan?

The Deputy of St. Martin:

Have you received a travel plan in relation to this new police station proposed?

Manager, Transport Policy:

We have received a first draft and asked them to do some further work on it. The way it would normally work is it would be a condition that they have to have a travel plan in place and make sure that it is active before they occupy the building.

Deputy J.H. Young:

What do you want from them?

Manager, Transport Policy:

The travel plan is just looking at how all the staff travel to work and what the users of that site are putting in place to discourage private car use.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

Have you satisfied yourself that they are addressing a number of issues that the travel plan is supposed to look at?

Manager, Transport Policy:

There are certain aspects which need to happen at an early stage, the physical things, for example making sure you have got motorbike parking, bicycle parking, showers, toilets, changing facilities all those sort of things that you need to encourage active travel. If they do not get that right at this stage then it is very hard to retrofit them, so that is being built in at this stage.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

Are they going to add cycle parking on site? It does say as part of the travel plan that it is to review cycle parking on site and off site.

Manager, Transport Policy:

The cycle parking is on the south side of the Route du Fort plus along by the entrance to Green Street car park.

[16:15]

The Deputy of St. Martin:

That is not on site though surely.

Manager, Transport Policy:

I do not believe there is any on site, no.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

Are you aware that they have negotiated to improve the bus service?

Manager, Transport Policy:

They have not negotiated to improve the bus service, no. That is a general comment on what you might expect to see in a travel plan.

The Connétable of St. John:

You say “general”?

Manager, Transport Policy:

Yes. I think Deputy Lewis is referring to the sort of things that a travel plan might have. If you are looking at a ...

The Deputy of St. Martin:

I agree. “6.3, Workplace travel plans. Potential measures to be included in the travel plan could be ...” and then you just go down the list: “Negotiate improved bus services, offering incentives for alternatives to private car use, car-sharing, flexible working practices, subsidies to staff for changing their modes of travel, restricting car parking, bicycle buddy schemes.” I do not know what that means. Minister, could you enlighten me on that one?

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

Bicycle buddies? Over to you.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

Is that taking somebody on the pillion?

Manager, Transport Policy:

That would be one way of doing it, tandems would count, but it is about if you are a less confident cyclist then you get a confident cyclist to show somebody the way, and it is surprising how many of these things can start to encourage travel.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

I would suggest that if you are not a confident cyclist get in a car quick.

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

All the team are cyclists.

Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:

We will be very happy to take the panel out on any cycling adventure. I know the Constable of St. John does lots of cycling to and from the pub.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

The Chairman as well. The Chairman is a keen cyclist.

The Connétable of St. John:

And on the Continent by the way.

Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:

To pubs on the Continent as well? [Laughter]

The Deputy of St. Martin:

Getting back to my travel plan, if for example the proposed police station has not taken into account half of those ideas on that potential list would you turn round and say: "We do not believe that you have seriously addressed the travel plan"?

Manager, Transport Policy:

You would have to talk to the planning officers about how to impose these things upon them.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

This is because it is very much more in their ball court than yours?

Manager, Transport Policy:

Yes, but we have now got an officer at T.T.S. who, among various other functions, is available to work with all these people that are expected to have travel plans and see that they are effective. So any large office block will have to produce a travel plan and if you keep working at it you can get that little shift towards some people being more aware of their travel choices to the good.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Can I come in on that? One of the planning policies about travel plans says that the Minister should form an opinion as to whether to rely on a travel plan or not on its degree of enforceability. The policy talks about incentives and so on. What I am looking for from you is what mechanics would you expect to be in place to make sure that the travel plan is not just a piece of paper, that it has some real teeth to achieve what is necessary in a major new building in this area, from what you have told us.

Manager, Transport Policy:

We will work with the Planning Department and, if I am honest, it is early days with forcing the private sector to have travel plans as a consequence of a planning permit. We need to work up a system that will give these things a better chance of working.

Deputy J.H. Young:

So that is to come? You have not done that yet?

Director of Transport:

We are working with Education in terms of implementing travel plans and monitoring their effectiveness at schools and starting to collect data to measure what impact they are having on parents travel and dropping children off at school on the way.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

Are we on target to have all States departments with a travel plan by the end of 2015?

Manager, Transport Policy:

Yes.

Deputy J.M. Maçon:

On this point, the key word there is being effective, an effective plan. This is Scrutiny; we have to ask for the evidence. Can you give us some sort of demonstration, either States sector or private sector, locally in Jersey where travel plans have been used where there is the evidence to back up that they are effective and enforceable?

Director of Transport:

They are relatively new to the Island in terms of measuring their effectiveness, but certainly we have done work with the Isle of Wight and looked at the effectiveness of travel planning with their schools and they have had notable successes. You would agree with that, would you not?

Manager, Transport Policy:

Yes. We have had some modal shift where we have been working with our own schools over here with their school travel plans.

Deputy J.M. Maçon:

But the answer to my question is you do not have any evidence to support that travel plans have been able to work locally, they are still new?

Manager, Transport Policy:

We have got some evidence at schools, not at offices.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Why have you got a lever to enforce it in schools but not in this project? What is missing?

Director of Transport:

We do not have a lever to enforce it in schools. It is really about getting people to buy in and want to change their habits and to see the benefits of changing their habits. Going back to what the Chief Officer said about Sustrans, it is about persuading people that there are benefits to them of changing their mode of travel and selling them the advantages. It is almost in some respects a personal marketing exercise: how are we better off by not using my car?

The Connétable of St. John:

Can I mention on that? Daily I see people cycling without lights or tail lights and without even fluorescent clothing in many cases, not only on the roads but on footpaths. You are promoting cycling and the like. What are you doing to make sure that that is policed, that they do have fluorescent clothes, they do have lights on their bicycles? How people are not getting killed I do not know but I know people do get knocked over. We have no way of identifying these people and you are promoting alternative transport out of the car. I see these guys - because I come into town most mornings about 6.30 a.m. and go back up to St. John for about 7.30 p.m - all coming into town on various types of bicycles, and to me it is an accident waiting to happen, and they do happen.

Manager, Transport Policy:

Can I come in on that, because the Minister is going to be producing 2 pieces of work very shortly. One is the Active Travel Strategy and the other is the Road Safety Strategy. They are both relevant to that and we are aware obviously of your proposition that went to the States, which charged I think probably the previous Minister to look into this issue of how cyclists behave on the road. So the Active Travel Strategy is about how to encourage pedestrians and cyclists, but it also addresses the issues that you are talking about, cyclists with bad habits on the road. The Road Safety Strategy as well obviously relates to that, so we are talking to the police about how to address these things. The police have got a much more noticeable presence for traffic offences out and about these days than they had some years ago, so ...

The Connétable of St. John:

They are still allowing them to pass through a road check this last week, a fortnight ago, outside my own parish. They are stopping vehicles, and people without lights are driving up in the direction. I could not believe it. They were not stopped.

Director of Transport:

It might not be uniform at the moment, but I have certainly seen the police on bicycles stop people from cycling on the footpath and across public spaces where they are not permitted, so I think

there is a growing awareness there, even if we are not as consistent as we would like to be now. That is obviously just a casual observation.

Deputy J.H. Young:

I am sure mostly they will be policemen, presumably, riding these pushbikes, so we will assume the police enforce themselves and police the police.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

Chairman, if I could get back to trying to reduce car driving on the Island, Minister, there is a computerised car-sharing scheme that has been launched. Is that your department that is responsible for administering it?

Manager, Transport Policy:

A computerised car-sharing scheme? I am not sure what scheme you are talking about here.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

It says here: "A computerised car-sharing scheme has been launched for all States employees" it gives the website, "and that allows people to register their journey so that appropriate matches with other staff throughout the States can be identified."

Manager, Transport Policy:

Sorry, I am with you now. Yes, we set up a system called Travel Together, which attempts to match people and then you can car-share and reduce your costs of travelling, but it has not had much success, if I am honest.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

Does it need to be promoted more?

Deputy J.M. Maçon:

If we can take one step back, why has it not been as successful as you would like?

Manager, Transport Policy:

I personally think that things have moved on a bit since we launched it. These days with smartphones and apps, youngsters do quite a lot of car-sharing through Facebook and Twitter, stuff that I cannot explain properly, but I think the Travel Together software is probably old hat now, the wrong generation, and my view is that things have moved on a little bit. But we tried that

a couple of years back. We did promote it among States employees, but we had a very low uptake.

Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:

Yes, I have car-shared in my previous life when I did not live here, and it can be very successful if you find the right people to car-share with, but if you do it with the wrong people, it is the worst possible experience. As Dave said, the applications and the smartphones and the intuitive way that the younger generation are behaving now means that these things are far more prevalent than we perhaps know.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

How do we encourage more people to share car journeys, Minister?

Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:

We did mention the multi-occupancy lane, which is if we were brave enough - and I think that is a political bravery - it would be really interesting to try that going east on Victoria Avenue in the morning and west on Victoria Avenue in the evening.

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

There are some private companies too that are endorsing this. HSBC have got a car-sharing scheme which I believe is quite successful.

Deputy J.H. Young:

I think time is moving on. I am going to draw this bit to a close, if I can. Just to close that session, I am not hearing there is at the moment any incentives in place to achieve that; it is a softer strategy that is in place.

Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:

The incentives are personal and predominantly about health, long-term benefits of not using the car for your daily transport and the productive elements that come within cycling or walking or running or whatever.

Deputy J.H. Young:

There are a couple of areas I want to clear up before we draw to a close and then I will ask my colleagues if there any other things they want to clear up. The proposal, as I understand it there, is visitor spaces, 3 of them in Snow Hill. Is that correct? These are dedicated spaces for people who want to visit the police headquarters who cannot park. Is that enough? Have you looked at the numbers? Have you discussed with the ...

Manager, Transport Policy:

We have discussed it with the police and looked at how many people they get through the door, which is quite low. It is not the sort of use like Social Security or whatever where you have got hundreds of people an hour coming in and out.

Deputy J.H. Young:

It is all right if you come by bus, if you go to the police headquarters.

Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:

Get arrested, they take you there, do they not?

Deputy J.H. Young:

How do you keep those 3 spaces free? How are you going to do that?

Director of Transport:

Just going back to the 3 spaces, we said before on normal shopping days, certainly on week days, the occupancy of our shopper car parks is about 50 per cent, and there are generally spaces available there. On Saturdays, when the shopper car parks may be a bit fuller, there are definitely spaces available in Green Street, so although there are these dedicated spaces, there should be other options in the area. With regards to the ensuring that they are kept free for visitors, then they will just be clearly signed.

Deputy J.H. Young:

What about if somebody is in a wheelchair? How are they going to the police headquarters?

Manager, Transport Policy:

There is a layby at the front of the building which will accommodate disabled ...

Deputy J.H. Young:

So a car ...

Deputy J.M. Maçon:

Assuming of course they do not have a delivery at the time.

Manager, Transport Policy:

Yes, that will have to be managed.

The Connétable of St. John:

But also on that point then, given that we had not dissimilar when we built Maritime House and we were told that this will be for the public, and we get there now and there is a barrier and the public have got no way of getting in, and it is all filled up with Customs and Maritime staff.

Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:

They are kept in behind.

The Connétable of St. John:

At the time we gave the advice - and I was on the committee - that was told, but things change, and all of a sudden they put a barrier up and it becomes for their own use, and the staff themselves park in there. That I do not want to see happen on this, and it creates a bigger problem, because you have to park over the road or wherever else, wherever you can. So you put in an extra 20 minutes on a meeting because things that have been arranged for outside visitors to come in gets taken over by staff. Now, how are you going to prevent that?

Manager, Transport Policy:

The spaces immediately in front of the building, you will only be allowed to use those if you are a disabled badge user, so I would not expect that to be abused. I think it is unlikely that police would park their ...

The Connétable of St. John:

But if there is 3 spaces across the road, you can guarantee it will be abused within no time at all.

Deputy J.M. Maçon:

Snow Hill.

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

Well, they will be patrolled by parking control officers.

Deputy J.M. Maçon:

Just on that, how will the department determine what is a legitimate visitor in a visitor space in Snow Hill when they are all the way at the police station at the inquiry desk?

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

Are you talking about probation officers or Joe public?

Deputy J.M. Maçon:

I am talking about the T.T.S. parking inspectors.

Director of Transport:

If, for instance, a car was regularly found upon that space, so say every day, then the parking control officers through the control room could contact the police to check that that was a visitor to the police station. The other thing we can do is we can review how they are used and limit the amount of time you are parked there to disincentivise people to use them for other purposes, and of course if you are parked there and receive a ticket, but you are there for a legitimate purpose, then the police would give a note which could be produced to parking control to avoid the parking ticket. So there are mechanisms you can use to ensure as much as possible that those are reserved for visitors to the police station, much in the same way as it works at the bottom of Patriotic Street for people who use the hospital.

[16:30]

Deputy J.M. Maçon:

Okay. I am just making sure that the safeguards are there. Thank you.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Can I just check, you have obviously made a decision to push for motorbike and bicycle parking as a replacement for cars here. Is that something that the police themselves, the staff have asked for? Are you aware, do they all have motorbike licences? Are they all keen to ride 2-wheelers?

Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:

There is a lot of motorbike usage within the police, yes.

Deputy J.H. Young:

You have done a survey of that, have you?

Director of Transport:

Yes.

The Connétable of St. John:

Is that because of the recession or is it because we got rid of the motorcyclist section of police headquarters a few years back? We have reintroduced it, but not in the same format, where you had X officers, because they could not fill up sufficient officers to go on their 6-hour shifts,

whatever it is they do, so they had to do it in a totally different way. So it is fine in the summer, everyone wants to be on a motorbike when the sun is out, but when you have weather like we have over the last few months, so much rain, I leave mine at home and you probably do as well more often than not, and you come in the vehicle, in a car, because you want shelter. Now, really, are you telling us that they are going to be, especially once they have been in the job 3 or 4 years and the novelty of coming on a motorbike and parking across the road wears off for most of them ...

Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:

I think a lot of policemen use motorcycles because they have not got parking provision where they are now, and it is a very efficient and cheap way of travelling to St. Helier.

Director of Transport:

That survey is of existing motorcycle ridership within the police right now. That is the numbers that ...

Manager, Transport Policy:

The police have probably got a higher proportion of male and younger, fitter people that are able to use motorbikes and cycle. I suspect that is why they have a high proportion.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Can I ask my colleagues if there are other things they want to clear up before we ...

The Deputy of St. Martin:

I have just got one thing I wanted to say at the end. I do not have any more questions.

Deputy J.M. Maçon:

One absolutely minor point, and it is just as we have got the Minister for Transport and Technical Services here, judging from the plan, and it is a personal thing, it is going past where the new bus bay will be developed. It is going to have creepage and I know from the plan you have got: "Existing tree to be removed." What is going to happen with that, just because it is a particularly good tree there, and I would hope that it might be recycled somewhere else in the States estate.

Several:

Recycled?

Deputy J.M. Maçon:

Well, uprooted and deployed.

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

Once you uproot a tree of a reasonable size, you cannot plant it again, but ...

The Deputy of St. Martin:

You can, but it does not do it any good.

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

Yes, it is good for my St. Saviour Winter Warmers project, but that is another story. But no, we believe in preserving trees wherever possible and if we need to replant a new one, we will do so.

Deputy J.M. Maçon:

Okay, but that one is going. All right, fair enough. Thank you.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Phil?

The Connétable of St. John:

No.

Deputy J.H. Young:

I have just got one. Do you know where this car park is where we are told there is a possibility that the police may be able to rent the space and make it available for staff for 40 spaces? Do you know where this is?

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

I am not sure if that has been released yet, because it is being handled by Property Holdings.

Deputy J.H. Young:

You mean it is secret?

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

I do not know if they have signed a contract on it yet or whether that is pending, so ...

Deputy J.H. Young:

But you know where it is?

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

I do not know where it is.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Do you know where it is?

Manager, Transport Policy:

I do not know where it is.

Deputy J.H. Young:

We will have to ask the other Ministers.

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

Yes.

Deputy J.H. Young:

You wanted to ...

The Deputy of St. Martin:

No, I just wanted to say, Minister, that there is obviously an issue with car parking and that is why we are here. I think we are quite fortunate. This proposed bus station site is on the main road that runs east-west. It is also easily accessible from the north-east and the parish of Trinity if you travel on a bus. It would be my hope that we will find a way of creating a good, safe bus stop on both sides of the road outside the police station and that the buses will travel frequently enough from all over the Island into town and allow people who might otherwise think of using a car to take the bus, and that the thought of going to the police station would involve also the thought of: "Well, I will have to get on a bus to do it, but I know the bus will go every quarter of an hour and I know it will drop me outside." I think if people know they can get on the bus outside the police station, they may well do that.

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

I would agree with everything you have said today, and also go further to say that I have been sat here, I have seen several double-decker buses pass the window here, which is very encouraging. We have got extra capacity now on the buses. We have got 6 double-deckers on the southern route, that it is comfortable for people to go to work on the bus, we get everyone in suits coming in there, they are getting off at the Esplanade, they are getting off the other side of the tunnel too and it is something I encourage.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

The only thing I would say in conclusion is that I think if we were determined to try to get people to travel to the police station on the bus that we need to look at retaining the bus layby on the other side of the road from the proposed station, and also the potential to create something outside the station which would do a similar thing. The road is quite wide there, and we could do something.

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

There is space obviously on the other side of the road, and more than happy to look at this side of the road again.

Deputy J.H. Young:

But that would go against what you have just said, Minister, that clearly what I am hearing is there is a choice. Either you have the space for the motorbikes and the cycles, or you have the bus layby to create a quality provision, as Deputy Luce has said.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

But if we are serious about getting people to move on to buses, we want to be serious about losing a few more car parking places, and if we have to do that in Green Street car park, c'est la vie.

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

There is a long lawn stretch on the far side of the road there, so more than happy to ask the team to look at that again.

Deputy J.H. Young:

So we could talk to the Minister for Planning about this as well as to what capacity there is within this building to accommodate what Deputy Luce is flagging up.

Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:

Certainly bicycles are key.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Yes, but decent facilities for buses, because we have spent a lot of time ...

The Deputy of St. Martin:

I think that has got to be done on the road though, Chairman, because double-deckers, you cannot have double-deckers going anywhere near the site. It would move ...

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

We have modified Liberation Station, as you have probably noticed.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Yes. Well, we have got the traffic engineers here. The traffic engineers could design that. You could design that, could you not? Minister, that would fall within your brief that Deputy Luce has asked for.

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

Yes.

Deputy J.H. Young:

So you will look at that and come back to us, will you?

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

Absolutely, indeed.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Will you be able to do that in a short timescale, because obviously we do not have long to produce this report. In fact, we have hardly any time at all.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

Like tomorrow would be useful.

Manager, Transport Policy:

I am a little bit anxious about what we are promising here, because ...

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

We are promising to look at it.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

I am sure you will sort it out in a minute.

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

We are promising to look at it.

Manager, Transport Policy:

It would certainly need to impact on that ...

Deputy J.H. Young:

If you cannot see a way forward of doing what has been asked for perhaps ...

The Deputy of St. Martin:

I am just asking maybe, Minister, for a little bit of imagination. I drove there last night. I am aware that as we go down Route due Fort, it does narrow as you get towards the pedestrian area. Further on, the road is very wide and I just wonder if we could not find a way of finding proper, pull-in bus stops on both sides of the road.

Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:

Okay. When do you need to sort of ...

Deputy J.H. Young:

Like Monday, please.

Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:

Which Monday?

Deputy J.H. Young:

Next week. We need to know.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

It is not Easter Monday.

Deputy J.H. Young:

If it is not feasible, then you tell us, please, if you could, but if you think there is something there or you are prepared to give undertakings that you will do it or come up with some layout for the Minister to look at.

Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:

Okay. This is to create laybys.

Deputy J.H. Young:

I am not expecting you to produce a layout by Monday, but I think we want to know about the feasibility.

Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:

We can provide with a comment by Monday.

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

There is an existing bus layby on the far side.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Will my colleagues be content with that?

The Connétable of St. John:

Some sort of a comment one way or the other for the Minister, John.

Deputy J.H. Young:

With that, Scrutiny Officer, do you have any points that you think we have not covered, and you have been keeping track of everything for us?

Scrutiny Officer:

I think we have covered just about everything.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Well, thank you very much, Minister, and your team. Thank you very much for being so open with us, as you always are. We always enjoy meeting you and your team and have an open session and giving all that information.

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:

Thank you and your members, Chairman.

Deputy J.H. Young:

We will close the meeting with that, thank you. Thank you, ladies and gentlemen, for coming along to watch the Scrutiny process in action.

[16:38]